

A slum in Islamabad, Pakistan, BMC Public Health 2009

Article by Syeda Tasneem Kausar
Public Health, Texila American University, Pakistan
Email: sindy_070766@texilaconnect.com

Introduction

This review is critically reviewing the article ‘who am I? Where am I? Experiences of young women in a slum in Islamabad, Pakistan’ in the journal ‘Bio Med central Public health’. During this review, firstly the above mentioned article will be summarized. Secondly the article’s format, structure and the matters of readers understanding and access will be briefly analyzed. Thirdly this review will critique the article based on its authority, current approach, accuracy/validity, objectivity and coverage. It is said that “a critical review of a journal article is an evaluation of an article's strengths, weaknesses and validity” (H.T.Coutts). Furthermore this review will also analyze the graphs, tables utilized to present different results. Along with the above mentioned components the article will also be reviewed for its accessibility and credibility of the publishing journal.

Article summary:

The purpose of this study is to explore that how young women (age 13-19) are prepared for married life. It also finds out their experiences and knowledge of married Life in relation to sexual activity, child birth and inter-spousal relationship. Participants in the study were assessed for their background, social situation, decision making and spousal communication. Based on interviewing, two groups were found, submissive accepting and Submissive victims. Between the two groups who were living submissive satisfied life were older than the other group who were identifying themselves as victims. The article is explaining that the women in the victimized group are experiencing physical and verbal abuse because of their inability to cope with their duties as wife, care taker and bearer of children. The details provided in this article give valid information in the field of academics, which need further exploration. According to University of the Fraser Valley writing centre “scholarly review or critique consists of summarizing and evaluating an academic source that is of interest to academic audiences”

Article Structure:

The article is started with a brief abstract, which clearly states the purpose of the study and presents a brief overview of the prominent points in the article. The article comprises of different components for which clear headings are provided. The content under each heading is huge because it is large research study. As it is a research article conducting by different researchers, published in a research journal. All components of a true research process are covered with detailed elaboration. Main components include Abstract, Background, methodologies, results, discussion and Conclusion. All the components are presented in a logical sequence. At the beginning the abstract is given which presents a brief overview of the whole study. After Abstract the background discusses the issue of early marriages from different angles. The method section clearly explains the research approach, which was used to conduct the study. Furthermore the method section also explains the research setting, data collection methods, sampling techniques etc. the result findings are given in table form and in narrative story forms, which presents a detail picture of the whole scenario. In the discussion part it is clearly presented that the narratives based on interview helps to explain the impact of family, community and society on young women’s lives. At the end a brief conclusion is given, which provides stress of future implementation of the research findings. If the findings are utilized at the policy levels, it will have a great positive impact on the health of young

women. Overall the article is developed in a logical sequence. The authors' work places address and email address is provided, which will help in accessibility towards the authors.

Article Critique:

Authority: The journal, Bio Med Central public Health is an open access peer reviewed journal dealing the issues related to Epidemiology and Public health. One of the high focus points of this Journal is to study social aspects of the population. All articles of the Journal can be accessed through PUBMed, the most widely used biomedical Bibliographical database under the control of US national library of medicine. The availability of this article on internet increases its accessibility and decreases the cost of accessibility. According to (M.J. Metzger), "Internet and digitization technologies both lower the cost of and increase access to information production and dissemination" In the given article, the authors are acknowledged, by giving their Qualification, their place of work, and their Email addresses as well. The authors' information clearly indicates that they are involved in academic activities at different institutes of public health.

Accuracy: According to (M.J. Metzger), "Accuracy refers to the degree to which a Web site is free from errors, whether the information can be verified off line and the reliability of the information on the site". The literature which is being presented is accurate and quite relevant to the study. The given review is mostly from the developing countries, especially Pakistan and Bangladesh, which truly reflect the problem explored in the current study. One classical study conducted in Bangladesh, shown in the article on page 2, shows that a huge number of adolescent women in Bangladesh gave birth to children before their physical and emotional preparedness. A very clear and complete referencing is being given within text as well as at the end list, which further contributes to the accuracy and credibility of this research article.

Currency: According to (M.J. Metzger), "Currency refers to whether the information is up to date". This article was received on 16 April, 2009 and accepted for publication on 28 July, 2009. The issue of social destruction of young adolescent married women is an alarming current problem in almost all the developing countries. The relationship of the problem is clearly determined by different studies especially by two studies such as 'knowledge of personal and sexual development amongst young people in Pakistan', written by Hennink M, Rana I and Iqbal R and 'emerging changes in reproductive behavior among married adolescent girls in an urban slum in Dhaka' written by Rashid SF (p. 2). The above conducted studies have explicitly said that women married in early age face lots of physical emotional and social problems. Most of the sources utilized in this article are current.

Relevance: All of the articles of this journal are available on the academic database of PUBMed, therefore has high credibility in academic context. I feel that there are no disagreements on the point that this is a unanimously accepted problem in the developing world. Thus a great consensus is present on the problem, discussed in the given article. This study shows a high relevance on national levels in developing countries, because early marriages among women can lead to so many social and psychological problems. Therefore this is very important for the researchers and epidemiologists to explore this problem in very detail.

Objectivity: According to (M.J. Metzger), "Objectivity involves identifying the purpose of the site and whether the information provided is fact or opinion". The information in this article is objectively developed. Before taking interviews from the participants, a verbal and written informed consent was taken from each participant. Furthermore a very important step of interview tape recording was taken to maintain the accuracy and credibility of the gathered information. All the study participants were clearly explained about the research process. They were also given the right to leave the study at any point in time if they want. Sample was collected based on life experience of the participants and only those were interviewed, who could give very clear and solid information about the concepts (social, psychological, physical impacts etc) studied under research.

Stability: Stability of this article is proved by the acknowledgement of Authors of the study. All the authors are highly qualified, having relevant experience in their fields and well known researchers on a larger scale. Secondly, the Journal in which the article is published is a truly academic journal. All of the articles of this journal are available on a very authentic database, the PUB Med, which is strongly under the control of US national library of medical sciences. Thus it is quite evident that the article has a strong stability in term of sources.

Analysis of Graphs: No graphs are presented in the given research study, therefore this portion is Not applicable.

Conclusion:

During the above review, the article 'who am I? Where am I? Experiences of young women in a slum in Islamabad, Pakistan'; is summarized and critically reviewed. While reviewing the article a great attention is given to the content and structure of the article. The content and structure of the article are critically reviewed for its strengths and limitations. The above reviewed article strongly contributed to develop a huge knowledge about the preparedness for early marriages. The article has discussed all the issues related to early marriages among young women.

References:

- [1.] Article Review/Critique, University of the Fraser Valley writing center, Retrieved on 10th May, 2014 from <http://www.ufv.ca/media/assets/writing-centre/Article+review+and+critique.pdf>
- [2.] Coutts. H.T, Critical Reviews of Journal Articles; University of Alberta, Retrieved on 10th May 2014 from http://wwwbcf.usc.edu/~genzuek/Reviews_Journal_Articles.pdf
- [3.] Metzger. M.J, Making Sense of Credibility on the Web: Models for Evaluating Online Information and Recommendations for Future Research;, University of California Press